Regular Meeting February 15, 2001 1:30 p.m.

A Special meeting of the Municipal Civil Service Commission convened on Thursday, February 15, 2001, with Priscilla R. Tyson, Douglas S. Morgan, and Grady L. Pettigrew present.

* * *

RE: Employee of the Quarter for the 4th Quarter of 2000.

Commission President Tyson announced that Denise Nappier, Personnel Administrative Officer, has been selected for employee of the quarter for the 4th quarter of 2000.

* * *

RE: Review and approval of the December 18, 2000, regular meeting minutes.

This item was deferred to later in today's meeting.

* * *

RE: Review of the results of the pre-hearing conferences for the following cases:

- 1. Stephen R. Gibbs vs. Department of Public Safety, Division of Police, Appeal No. 00-CA-0029. Police Officer 80-Hour Suspension Hearing Scheduled for April 30, 2001.
- 2. James C. Ward vs. Department of Public Safety, Division of Fire, Appeal No. 00-CA-0026. Firefighter 48-Hour Suspension Hearing Scheduled for February 26, 2001.
- 3. Tondalaya Davis vs. Columbus Public Schools, Appeal No. 00-BA-0017. Food Service Helper Discharge Trial Board scheduled for March 12, 2001.

PRESENT: Theresa Lynn Carter, Deputy Executive Director

Ms. Carter appeared before the Commissioners and reported on the results of three pre-hearing conferences conducted on January 29, 2001.

<u>Stephen R. Gibbs</u> – Police Officer, Department of Public Safety, Division of Police, 80-hour suspension. Officer Gibbs is appealing on the merits and to mitigate the 80-hour suspension. John Waddy will represent Officer Gibbs and John Sumner will represent the city. Messrs. Waddy and Sumner will call four joint witnesses and Mr. Waddy has an additional seven witnesses to call. There is no potential settlement and it is estimated the hearing will take two and one-half days.

<u>James C. Ward</u> – Firefighter, Department of Public Safety, Division of Fire, 48-hour suspension. Firefighter Ward is representing himself and Michael Matuska will represent the City. Three witnesses will be called. It is estimated that the hearing will take three to four hours.

<u>Tondalaya Davis</u> – Food Service Helper, Columbus Public Schools, discharge. Thomas Drabick is representing Ms. Davis and Loren Braverman will represent Columbus Public Schools. Mr. Braverman plans to call two witnesses and Mr. Drabick will call Ms. Davis.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise Rule VI(E)(1)(o) and Rule VI(E)(2) with regard to the drug testing of applicants.

PRESENT: Theresa Lynn Carter, Deputy Executive Director

Ms. Carter presented the staff's request to revise Rule VI with regard to drug testing applicants. Earlier this year, the City implemented a drug-testing program. Any applicant who receives a conditional offer of employment must pass a drug test prior to appointment to a position. If the applicant fails, the applicant's name will be removed from any existing eligible lists on which his or her name appears. The applicant will also be precluded from obtaining City employment for one year. The proposed change to Rule VI(E)(2) makes the Rule consistent with the City's drug testing policy.

Rule VI(E)(1)(p) applies to Police Officer, Police Communication Technician and Firefighter applicants. These standards contain provisions, which require the removal of applicants who admit the use

of illegal drugs within one to three years of application. The proposed revision to Rule VI(E)(1)(0) makes it clear that it is only applicable to Public Safety entry-level positions that are not covered by the Background Removal Standards.

A motion was made, seconded and unanimously passed to revise Rule VI as proposed. The revised section of Rule VI read as follows:

RULE VI ANNOUNCEMENTS AND APPLICATIONS

E. <u>Disqualification of Applicants and Eligibles</u>

- 1. Applicants may be rejected from consideration or refused admittance to an examination, and eligibles may be disqualified or removed from an eligible or certification list, for, but not limited to, the following causes:
 - o. The individual, during information revealed in a background investigation, admits to current use of the drugs of abuse as defined in Section 3719.011 of the Ohio Revised Code. This provision is only applicable to applicants for entry-level positions in the Department of Public Safety, and who are not subject to Rule VI(E)(1)(p).
- 2. In the event an individual is rejected, refused, or disqualified pursuant to Rule VI(E)(1)(n), (o), or (p), the individual shall be precluded from employment with the City for one (1) year.

* * *

RE: Request of <u>David C. Wilson</u> to withdraw the appeal of the action of the Department of Public Safety, Division of Police, suspending him for 30 days from the position of Police Officer – Appeal No. 00-CA-0021.

President Tyson acknowledge receipt of Officer Wilson's request to withdraw his appeal. A motion was made, seconded and approved to accept the request.

* * *

RE: Review of the findings and recommendation of the Trial Board for a hearing held on December 11, 2000:

Yefim Kunis – Appeal Number 00-BA-0007.

This item was deferred to later in today's meeting.

* * *

RE: Columbus Public School classification requests.

No Columbus Public School classification requests were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification City Treasurer (U) with no revisions (Class Code 0157.

PRESENT: Tamira Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tamira Rollins presented the Commission's request to approve the specification review for City Treasurer (U) with no revisions. In accordance with Civil Service Commission policy, any classification that has not been reviewed during the past five years shall be reviewed and revised if needed. This classification was last reviewed in August of 1995.

After a close review and consultations with departmental representatives, it was determined that no changes are necessary for this classification at this time.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Deputy City Treasurer (U) with no revisions (Class Code 0158).

PRESENT: Tamira Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tamira Rollins presented the Commission's request to approve the specification review for Deputy City Treasurer (U) with no revisions. In accordance with Civil Service Commission policy, any classification that has not been reviewed during the past five years shall be reviewed and revised if needed. This classification was last reviewed in June of 1994.

After a close review and consultations with departmental representatives, it was determined that no changes are necessary for this classification at this time.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Development Director (U) with no revisions (Class Code 0061).

PRESENT: Tamira M. Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tamira M. Rollins presented the Commission's request to approve the specification review for Development Director (U) with no revisions. In accordance with Civil Service Commission policy, any classification that has not been reviewed during the past five years shall be reviewed and revised if needed. This classification was last reviewed in August of 1995.

While the department is pursuing future revisions to this specification, it is not prepared to proceed at this time. Accordingly, staff recommended the classification specification be approved as presented with no revisions and will present the specification for future action upon the department's initiation.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Commission Secretary (U) [Class Code 0497].

PRESENT: Tamira M. Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tamira M. Rollins presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Commission Secretary (U). This request is in response to the Commission's commitment to ensure that every classification specification is reviewed every five years and revised if necessary. This specification was last reviewed in April of 1994. There are currently two position incumbents serving in this classification, both in the Trade and Development Department.

Upon discussion with a representative from this department, it was requested that the examples of work section of the specification be revised to refer to "minutes" rather than "notes". No other revisions were recommended.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Safety Program Manager (Class Code 1718).

PRESENT: Tamira M. Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tamira M. Rollins presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Safety Program Manager in response to the Commission's objective to revise all classification specifications five or more years old. This specification was last revised in November of 1987. There are currently six positions allocated to the classification in the departments of Public Safety, Public Service and Public Utilities.

By definition, the Safety Program Manager is responsible for developing, managing and evaluating a safety program for a department or division. This definition statement is largely unchanged as it

accurately represents the work performed by this classification. The examples of work section was recommended for revision to be more illustrative of the types of duties that may be performed by incumbents in positions allocated to this classification. The only proposed revision to the minimum qualification section was formatting in nature. No revisions were proposed to the knowledge, skills and abilities section of the specification. It was recommended that the probationary period remain 365 days and that the examination type remain designated as competitive.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Refuse Collection District Assistant Manager (Class Code 3931).

PRESENT: Donald E. White, Personnel Analyst Supervisor

Donald E. White presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Refuse Collection District Assistant Manager that was last reviewed in July of 1996. In May of 1993 Refuse Collection Supervisor I was merged into the Refuse Collection Vehicle Operator (Manual) classification. In June of 1994, Refuse Collection Supervisor II was retitled Refuse Collection Supervisor (since there was no longer a Supervisor I, the Supervisor II designation was not needed). During the minimum qualifications review of Refuse Collection District Assistant Manager it was discovered that the assistant manager specification still required experience "through one (1) or more lower level supervisors." Since there are no longer two levels of supervision below the assistant manager, this requirement has created an artificial barrier to advancement for current supervisors in the Refuse Collection Division.

It was therefore recommended that the minimum qualifications section of this specification be revised to "Completion of the twelfth school grade and two years of supervisory experience". No other revisions were recommended.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Line Worker (Class Code 4024).

PRESENT: Donald E. White, Personnel Analyst Supervisor

Donald E. White presented the Commission's request to revise the specification for the classification Traffic Line Worker as part of the Commission's ongoing policy of reviewing classifications that have not been reviewed for five years or more. This classification was last updated in March of 1995. There are currently sixteen incumbents in the classification.

It was recommended that the definition be revised to read under "general" supervision instead of "immediate" supervision. In addition, troubleshooting and fabrication of overhead and underground traffic signal cable was added. The examples of work section of the specification was recommended for revision due to new materials and techniques used in the installation and maintenance of traffic lines. It was also recommended that revisions to the knowledge, skills and abilities include the ability to climb fifty-foot utility poles and to operate large power equipment.

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: RESIDENCY REQUIREMENT REVIEWS

After reviewing the documentation submitted by James A. Carsey, Police Officer, the Commission found that Officer Carsey is in compliance with the residency requirement.

* * *

RE: PERSONNEL ACTIONS

No personnel actions were submitted this month.

RE: ADMINISTRATIVE/JURISDICTIONAL REVIEWS.

This item was deferred to later in today's meeting.

* * *

RE: BACKGROUND ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEWS.

This item was deferred to later in today's meeting.

* * *

The Commissioners took a short recess at .2:00 p.m.

* * *

The Commissioners reconvened today's meeting at 2:10 p.m.

* * *

RE: ADMINISTRATIVE/JURISDICTIONAL REVIEWS.

Review of the appeal of <u>Wayne J. Naylor</u> regarding the disapproval of his application for the Parks Maintenance Worker examination – Appeal No. 00-CA-0031.

The Commissioners reviewed Mr. Naylor's appeal and information he attached regarding his work experience. Information omitted from an original application cannot be submitted after the application has been reviewed. The Commissioners upheld the rejection of Mr. Naylor's application and dismissed his appeal without a hearing pursuant to Commission Rule XIII(G)(1).

Review of the appeal of <u>William C. Fitzpatrick</u> regarding the denial of his ADA testing accommodation request for the Fire Captain promotional examination – Appeal No. 00-CA-0032.

Review of the appeal of <u>Gary L. Knapp</u> regarding the denial of his ADA testing accommodation request for the Fire Captain promotional examination – Appeal No. 00-CA-0033.

Review of the appeal of <u>Brian R. Willison</u> regarding the denial of his ADA testing accommodation request for the Fire Lieutenant promotional examination – Appeal No. 00-CA-0034.

The Commissioners reviewed these three appeals regarding the denial of requests for Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) testing accommodations for the 2001 Fire Captain promotional competitive examination. Based upon a review of information related to these appeals, the Commissioners determined that the testing accommodations requested are not required by the ADA. The appeals were therefore denied and dismissed without a hearing pursuant to Commission rule XIII(G)(1).

Review of the appeal of <u>Don Savinsky</u> regarding the disapproval of his application for the Inventory Control & Property Manager examination – Appeal No. 00-CA-0035.

Mr. Savinsky had previously filed a request for review regarding the rejection of his application, therefore, the Commissioners decided to treat his second request as an appeal. Mr. Savinsky's application was rejected due to insufficient experience as required. Mr. Savinsky provided additional information with his appeal indicating further experience. However, information omitted from an original application cannot be submitted after the application has been reviewed. The Commissioners upheld the rejection of Mr. Savinsky's application and dismissed his appeal without a hearing pursuant to Commission Rule XIII(G)(1).

Review of the appeal of Reggie Anglen regarding the denial of his ADA testing accommodation request for the Police Communications Technician examination – Appeal No. 01-CA-0003.

The Commissioners reviewed the Motion for Indefinite Stay submitted by Mr. Anglen's attorney via facsimile on February 12, 2001, and via regular mail on February 14, 2001. The motion was granted and no decision was rendered with regard to this appeal.

* * *

RE: Review and approval of the December 18, 2000 regular meeting minutes.

The minutes were approved as written.

* * *

RE: Review of the findings and recommendation of the Trial Board for a hearing held on December 11, 2000:

Yefim Kunis – Appeal Number 00-BA-0007.

The Commissioners adopted the recommendation of the Trial Board that the suspension of Yefim Kunis from his position of Environmental Systems Technician be modified from ten (10) workdays to five (5) workdays.

* * *

RE: BACKGROUND ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEWS

Police Communication Technician Applicants Removed During the Prescreening Process January 24, 2001

Lenny Wills Criminal Activity (G.4)

The Commission reviewed <u>Lenny Wills'</u> file and decided he would not be permitted to take the Police Communication Technician examination.

Background Administrative Reviews

	January 17, 2001	
Jennifer E. Magaw	Police Communications Technician	01-BR-001
Billy D. Marshall	Police Officer	01-BR-002
James K. Fuqua	Police Officer	01-BR-003
Carl M. Brugger	Police Officer	01-BR-004
Joseph D. Belmonte	Firefighter	01-BR-005
Brendan P. Campbell	Firefighter	01-BR-006
Paul J. Poplawski	Police Officer	01-BR-007
Mark W. Kimmerle	Police Officer	01-BR-008
Jeffrey S. Mays	Firefighter	01-BR-010

The Commissioners reviewed <u>Jennifer E. Magaw's</u> file and decided her name would not be reinstated to the Police Communications Technician eligible list.

The Commissioners reviewed the files of <u>Billy D. Marshall and Mark W. Kimmerle</u> and deiced their names would be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

The Commissioners reviewed <u>Jeffrey S. Mays'</u> file and decided his name would be reinstated to the Firefighter eligible list.

After reviewing the files for <u>James K. Fuqua, Carl M. Brugger and Paul J. Poplawski</u>, the Commissioners decided their names would not be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

After reviewing <u>Joseph D. Belmonte and Brendan P. Campbell's</u> files, the Commissioners decided their names would not be reinstated to the Firefighter eligible list.

Background Administrative Reviews January 17, 2001

January 17, 2001				
Chuck L. Miller	Police Officer	01-BR-011		
April M. Treece	Police Officer	01-BR-012		
Beth Ann Freshwater	Police Officer	01-BR-013		
Kevin R. Herron	Police Officer	01-BR-014		
Randy F. Blevins	Police Officer	01-BR-015		

Matthew M. Ramarge	Police Officer	01-BR-016
Lance R. Evans	Firefighter	01-BR-017
Raymond M. Simmons	Police Officer	01-BR-019
Steve Rowlands	Police Officer	01-BR-020

The Commissioners reviewed <u>Beth Ann Freshwater's</u> file and decided her name would be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

After reviewing the files of <u>Chuck L. Miller, April M. Treece, Kevin R. Herron, Randy F. Blevins, Matthew M. Ramarge, Raymond M. Simmons and Steve Rowlands</u> the Commissioners decided their names would not be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

The Commissioners reviewed $\underline{\text{Lance R. Evans}}$ ' file and decided his name would not be reinstated to the Firefighter eligible list.

* * *

The Commission adjourned its meeting at 2:13 p.m.

* * *

	February 26, 2001
Priscilla R. Tyson, Commission President	Date